

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
7 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**  
8

9 Francisco V Chala,

No. CV-23-01488-PHX-ROS

10 Petitioner,

**ORDER**

11 v.

12 Ryan Thornell, et al.,

13 Respondents.

14

15 On March 14, 2024, Magistrate Judge Deborah M. Fine issued a Report and  
16 Recommendation (“R&R”) concluding Petitioner Francisco V. Chala’s petition for writ  
17 of habeas corpus was untimely by more than twenty years. (Doc. 14). Petitioner did not  
18 file any objections. Therefore, the R&R will be adopted in full.

19 Accordingly,

20 **IT IS ORDERED** the R&R (Doc. 14) is **ADOPTED**. The petition for writ of  
21 habeas corpus (Doc. 1) is **DENIED**. The Clerk of Court shall enter judgment in favor of  
22 Respondents and close this case.

23 ...

24 ...

25 ...

26 ...

27 ...

28 ...

1       **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** leave to proceed in forma pauperis and a  
2 certificate of appealability are **DENIED** because dismissal of the petition is justified by a  
3 plain procedural bar and reasonable jurists would not find the ruling debatable, and  
4 because Petitioner has not made a substantial showing of the denial of a constitutional  
5 right.

6       Dated this 23rd day of April, 2024.

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28



Honorable Roslyn O. Silver  
Senior United States District Judge